

MEETING: Governing Body

Item Number: 10.1

DATE: 25 November 2014

<p>REPORT TITLE:</p>	<p>Healthier Together Committee in Common – Responses to Consultation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Healthwatch Wigan – Response to the Healthier Together Consultation Executive Summary • Healthwatch Wigan – Review of the “Healthier Together” Transport and Access Study – Executive Summary
<p>CORPORATE OBJECTIVE ADDRESSED:</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Supporting our population to stay healthy and live longer in all areas of the Borough; 2. Commissioning high quality services, which reflect the population’s need, delivering good clinical outcomes and patient experience within the resources available; 3. Function as an effective commissioning organisation that puts the patient first; 4. Function as an organisation that consistently delivers its statutory duties.
<p>REPORT AUTHOR:</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Healthwatch Wigan • The Traffic, Transport and Highway Consultancy (TTHC Ltd) on behalf of Health Watch Wigan
<p>PRESENTED BY:</p>	<p>Dr Tim Dalton</p>
<p>RECOMMENDATIONS/DECISION REQUIRED:</p>	<p>To be received for information</p>
<p>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY The Governing Body is asked to note the contents of Healthwatch Wigan’s response to the Healthier Together Consultation for information.</p>	
<p>FURTHER ACTION REQUIRED:</p>	<p>None</p>
<p>EQUALITY AND DIVERSITY: Confirmed that any changes to service or procedure introduced as a result of this report do not impact adversely on any of the protected groups covered by the Equality Act 2010.</p>	



Response to the Healthier Together Consultation

October 2014



*“helping citizens
and communities
get the best out of
health and social
care services in
the Borough of
Wigan”*

Acknowledgements:

Healthwatch Wigan are very grateful to the directors, staff and volunteers who have contributed to this report and the enormous amount of work that lies behind it - numerous meetings, discussions, observations, events, research, editing and commenting over an 18 month period.

- **Healthwatch Wigan** Company No. 08496412. Registered in England
- Registered address: Wigan Life Centre (North), The Wiend, Wigan, WN1 1NH
- This report can be downloaded from www.healthwatchwigan.org

1 - Executive Summary

1. Healthwatch Wigan is part of a national network of local Healthwatch organisations. As the independent champions of patients and the public in health and social care we strive to help children, young people and adults speak up about health and social care locally and work to make sure that decision makers and providers of services act on the issues raised by local people.
2. Given the long standing poor record of health inequalities in Wigan it is vitally important to make sure that official responses are fit for purpose to meet the needs of local residents.
3. Healthwatch Wigan has been at the forefront of criticism of the Healthier Together process prior to the formal consultation period. We have previously raised concerns over the legal basis for governance arrangements, the costs of the programme and poor approach to patient and public engagement.
4. It is the firmly held view of Healthwatch Wigan that centrally planned Healthier Together consultation activity has not been good enough:
 - We are critical of the decision to hold the consultation over the summer period, and to not extend the period beyond 12 weeks.
 - Delays in receiving formal approval to hold the consultation meant that early meetings were hastily planned, poorly promoted and badly attended.
 - The main consultation document was not available in hard copy until week 3, and copies of 'Guide to Best Care' and Easy Read documents were never readily available in hard copy.
 - Ambassadors were only recruited from week one and by week five, less than 400 had been recruited against a target of 1000.
 - The target to receive 50,000 responses to the consultation was massively missed with latest available figures showing only 12,749 responses by the end of week 11 of the consultation period.
5. In Wigan, local partners have worked closely to coordinate outreach activity. In particular Wigan CCG and WWL NHS FT undertook significant outreach which has led to higher levels of responses to the consultation from Wigan than other areas. There are many lessons to be learned from this for any future consultation processes.

6. The Healthier Together Pre Consultation Business Case is too large and complex to be the basis for a public consultation. Even after reading over 1000 pages of information and attending many events, Healthwatch Wigan still remain unconvinced over many of Healthier Together's claims and proposals:
 - i. Healthier Together claim their proposals will lead to 1500 lives being saved over five years - this is an exaggeration of their own mathematical calculations and a figure that will be impossible to measure in practice.
 - ii. Analysis of Healthier Together's Transport standards show that the majority of journeys from Wigan to a potential specialist hospital in either Salford or Bolton do not meet their own standards.
 - iii. NHS finances are complex and the Healthier Together programme is no different, however Healthier Together fails to suitably respond to the pressures facing the local health and social care system.
7. Healthwatch Wigan believes that there is a 'case for change' for transformation of health and social care services locally. The health and social care sector is facing financial and workforce pressures, standards need to improve and health inequalities need to be genuinely tackled.
8. Healthwatch Wigan advocates that it is essential for reform of the whole health and social care system to be done in conjunction. Crucially, Public Health needs to be included as part of these reforms.
9. Healthwatch Wigan has never believed it right to pitch one hospital against another in a public beauty contest to select specialist and general hospitals. We firmly believe that collaboration and cooperation between commissioners, providers, staff, patients and the public is the best way to ensure that we achieve 'best care' rather than competition.
10. Healthwatch Wigan is supportive of the emerging proposals of the 'North West Alliance' - a partnership of Wrightington, Wigan & Leigh NHS Foundation Trust, Salford Royal NHS Foundation Trust and Bolton NHS Foundation Trust -working together to achieve quality and safety standards. Healthwatch Wigan calls for full and meaningful patient and public involvement in developing these proposals at the earliest possibility. We would urge the Northwest Alliance to learn lessons from the Healthier Together process and not to repeat basic mistakes in relation to patient and public engagement again.

**REVIEW OF THE 'HEALTHIER TOGETHER'
TRANSPORT AND ACCESS STUDY
(HEALTHWATCH WIGAN)**

TTHC Ltd – the Traffic, Transport & Highway Consultancy

Manchester
St James' Building
79 Oxford Street
Manchester
M1 6EJ
(0161 235 8600)

Liverpool
Oriol Chambers
No.14 Water Street
Liverpool
L2 8TD

London
Mayfair Point
34 South Molton Street
London
W1K 5RG

www.TTHC.co.uk / WWW.TTHC.com

TTHC Ref: M14061-01
Date: October 2014

© **COPYRIGHT:** The contents of this document must not be copied or reproduced in whole or in part without the written consent of **TTHC**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

TTHC have undertaken an independent review of the 'Transport and Access' findings of the 'Healthier Together' Programme

Our report describes a review of the methodology and assumptions applied to the Programme's 'Options Development and Impact Assessment' work, which has been used to calculate a 'Preferred Option' for the future distribution of Specialised Healthcare Services.

Having carried out this review, it is clear that the 'Transport and Access' study in its current form is not a suitable or reliable basis upon which to guide the determination of the future distribution of Specialised Healthcare Services within Greater Manchester. The reasons for this conclusion are set out in detail within this report, but are summarised below:

- The criteria on which the Programme's assessment is based are unrealistic and are not consistent with Transport for Greater Manchester's general or healthcare-related accessibility guidance. For example, the Programme finds it acceptable to walk 800m to a bus stop, however, this is double the maximum walking distance as set by Transport for Greater Manchester for everyday trip making and almost 4 times the distance identified for Hospital-related trips.
- The Programme's assessment scenarios do not accurately reflect the Public Transport or Highway networks. The Programme does not take into account any of the imminent major improvement schemes to the road network, such as the M60 Smart Motorway, The Western Gateway Infrastructure Scheme and the Leigh Salford Manchester Busway. The accessibility levels presented by the Programme are therefore inaccurate.
- The Programme's conclusions rely upon specialist healthcare being provided by adjacent healthcare authorities close to the Greater

Manchester Boundary. The Programme has no control or influence over whether this can occur and should not rely neighbouring Healthcare Authorities providing specialist healthcare for Greater Manchester residents.

- The Programme does not consider, or undertake any assessment of, travel during the highway peak hours. All its calculations are based on 'off-peak' travel. This is despite peak periods resulting in increased journey times for both car and public transport travel.
- Checks of the Programme's results show that journeys cannot, in reality, be completed within the Programme's parameters. Journeys 'fail' for a variety of reasons, including excessive journey time, requiring too many changes of bus service and excessive walk distances. Some journeys fail on more than one parameter. This is the case for both the Baseline and future year scenarios.
- The above findings are supported by the results of journey surveys undertaken by Volunteers on behalf of Healthwatch Wigan. Of the journeys surveys, only 20% could be completed concurrent with the Programme's results.

These findings do not provide any confidence in the Programme's ability to accurately establish existing or future year accessibility levels or identify a Preferred Option for the distribution of future year Specialist Healthcare. The Conclusions of Healthier Together's 'Transport and Access' Programme are therefore unfounded and cannot be supported.